

MINUTES OF THE MEETING
JOINT MEETING OF THE TASK FORCES ON
CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS AND AUSTERITY & RESTRUCTURING OF GOVERNMENT

Date: **Friday, 17th May, 2019**
Time: **9:00 am to 1:00 pm**
Venue: **Darbar Hall, Punjab Civil Secretariat, Lahore**

The **12th** meeting of the ***Task Forces on Civil Service Reforms and Austerity & Restructuring of Government*** was jointly held at the Punjab Civil Secretariat, Lahore under the chair of Dr. Ishrat Husain. Following is a recap of the key areas of discussion and decisions.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
Update on Key Proposals & Initial Discussion	<p>The Chair apprised that since the last meeting of the Task Forces, there has been progress on two items.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Reorganization of Federal Government – A detailed exercise was carried out with regard to the categorization of about 440 organizations into different categories. This proposal was also discussed at the Secretaries Committee for incorporation of feedback. Subsequently, the proposals have been shared with all Ministries to solicit their feedback on the proposed configurations of organizational entities falling under their control. Now a 74 page draft summary has been prepared which includes a detailed mapping of the organizations, and will be presented before the Federal Cabinet in the near future. 2. Induction & Recruitment Reform – Proposals of the Task Forces have been finalized after consultation with the Federal Public Service Commission and a summary has been prepared for presentation to the Cabinet. The summary contains proposals regarding the exam and post-exam components of selection including the psychological exam as well as cluster based recruitment for occupational groups. <p>The Chair welcomed the launch of the Punjab Local Government Act 2019. He stated that Punjab had done well in defining self-contained and autonomous local government structures and appreciated the transfer of WASA and LDA to the Lahore Metropolitan Corporation. He also commended the Act for devolving functional aspects to the Tehsil level as focus was required to be shifted from the district tier, because they could no longer be treated as headquarters of local government due to increasing population. The government focus now needed to be on how to manage the growth of urban areas in the context of service delivery by local governments.</p> <p>There was also discussion on the possibility of engaging experts and consultants to assist the Task Forces. The Chair clarified that anyone is welcome to co-opt individuals from within the bureaucracy but consultants cannot be hired in large numbers due to limited resources. It was acknowledged that the transformation of</p>	

proposals of the Task Forces into implementable decisions required impetus, as the recommendations have to ultimately be agreed to by the Federal Cabinet. The members were sensitized that aspects of political economy have to be kept in mind and technocratic solutions have to stand the test of political feasibility.

It was also stated that while the Task Forces have done well, the transformation of recommendations into applicable policy takes time. It was urged that while greater patience would be required given the pace of the reform process, there ought to be priorities in place with particular regard to areas such as induction, training and performance management. There was a need to build consensus and move ahead through an incremental approach as opposed to the previous practice of generating reform reports. The recommendations of the Task Forces will succeed when those implementing them in the Ministries are fully on board.

General discussion on the state of the economy also took place and it was suggested by a member to reduce the size of government. Another member stressed that it was not the business of government to be in business and as such it needed to pull out from the power sector as a start. The Chair informed that restructuring of some organizations was underway in light of earlier recommendations of the Task Forces. Another member suggested that there was a need for the government to conduct a study on the informal economy. He also opined that there was a need for autonomy in nomination and selection process of University Vice Chancellors. The Chair highlighted that as a result of the Task Forces proposals, now a transparent system for selection of heads for key public sector organizations is in place, and the selection process for the NEPRA chief was a recent example.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
<p>Presentation / Discussion on Civil Service Training Reform</p>	<p>Mr. Umair Javed presented findings of surveys on Training Needs Assessment. The surveys were conducted at the Civil Services Academy, Specialised Training Institutes and National Institutes of Management. Those surveyed included fresh recruits at the pre-service stage of their careers, mid – career and senior civil servants.</p> <p>The general findings signaled a mismatch between the training imparted to civil servants at different points in their career and the work done by them while on the job. In their responses, the civil servants stated that the gap between their initial training in the form of the Common Training Program and the Specialized Training Program and the subsequent MCMC is too wide. They believe that shorter, more crisp and specialized courses in between this period would prove helpful.</p> <p>Furthermore, while a majority of respondents from MCMC batches 19 to 26 said they were satisfied with their civil service careers, 43.9% of them said that the training imparted to them was not useful for the postings they are assigned after their training. This may be due to the fact that trainings have come to be linked with promotion rather than skill enhancement.</p> <p>In a survey conducted with probationers from 41st to 46th Common, the findings revealed that about 70% of the respondents were dissatisfied with their monthly income at the beginning of their careers. The respondents also expressed demand for certain kinds of courses. These relate broadly to stress management, time management and writing skills. It is also important to account for the wide variation in the backgrounds of those recruited into the civil service. While some officers come from privileged backgrounds and attended elite</p>	

institutions, other officers come from backgrounds where they have attended public schools in rural areas. In light of this, it is important to create tailor made programs that also enhance soft skills such as dealing with the public, media; communication and team work etc. in addition to domain specific knowledge.

Mr. Javed stated that there was a particular need for tailor made programs on the subject of technology. Use of IT in courses such as the CTP is largely restricted to software such as Excel. There is little to no work on interpreting and analyzing data and statistical inference. At the mid-career level in particular, basic data interpretation skills are lacking and personal experiences and anecdotes are frequently used to inform policy. The Chair suggested that civil servants need to be trained to do their next job in a more effective manner, as opposed to solely treating training as a prerequisite to promotion. Training needs to have the flexibility that caters to the individual needs / weaknesses of an officer, and should enable self-identification of deficiencies.

A member suggested to draft the learning journey of individual officers so that trainings can be made more relevant to their individual skill enhancement. This learning journey ought to be informed by the job descriptions of different posts. On-the-job trainings were also suggested as an integral part of the training journey as these trainings are found to be more effective compared to courses that collectively cater to hundreds of participants. The example of State Bank of Pakistan was shared where the performance management system has been designed as a developmental tool for developing skills and catering to the professional needs of an individual. The training score card system at the SBP is linked effectively to career path movement along with performance appraisal and compensation.

It was suggested that allowing civil servants to go on temporary attachments to the private sector may be helpful in professional development and may prove effective in teaching them valuable skills in understanding the constraints under which the private sector functions. Members responded that this may not be prudent as it may benefit the individual but the

gains to public policy practice may be limited as these attachments may turn into permanent appointments in the private sector. A reference was made to the case of multiple civil servants in whom the government invested heavily by sending them to premier institutions such as Harvard Kennedy School to assist in the improvement of training institutes, only to have them leave service upon their return or occupy positions unrelated to the intended assignment.

The transformation of the role of civil servants over time in light of the changing environment was also discussed. In order for them to be effective and self-driven, it was felt by some that civil servants should be developed as leaders. In contrast, other members opined that there was a need for catalyzing an attitudinal change from perceiving themselves as ruler to public servant. A member stated that it would be unwise to expect officers to be trained at prestigious institutions only to return to the same kinds of jobs they were doing before. Hence, it is important to create room for progression that would allow them to utilize their acquired knowledge and qualification in their job and stay in service to make a change.

Participants of the meeting also cautioned that the work of civil servants should not be undervalued and the work done by them should not be dehumanized in favor of introducing objectivity to the process. In difficult times, particularly in the context of the War on Terror, they have performed to the best of their abilities in challenging circumstances. If there exists any apprehension among civil servants today, it is primarily because there is a feeling that government servants are consistently losing ground with their effectiveness particularly at the grassroots level.

Returning to the topic of training, members urged that any effective training would have to be a continuous process throughout the career of a civil servant and must be linked to performance management outcomes. Training needs to shift from training institutes to online mediums with the creation of digital offerings. While the need for online training was acknowledged, caution was advised to not undervalue the development of social skills and

networking made possible by courses conducted currently. A blended training approach combining face to face and online courses was recommended as the optimal alternative. Members reflected on the idea that training could be linked to certification that would make it compulsory to master skills to such a level that certification could be gained in specified areas. The idea of hand holding and advice by seniors in the initial years of an officer's career was also referred to and the positive impact it had had on motivation levels of junior officers.

Concluding the discussion on the topic, Mr. Javed ended his presentation with five major takeaways from the surveys conducted by him.

1. At the pre-service stage there is a need for better inculcation of soft skills such as writing, speaking skills, stress management and public management interface.
2. There is a need to create a learning environment where officers can take online courses during their postings and also be part of programs where they are allowed to self-identify their deficiencies.
3. There is a need to link training with current and subsequent postings to increase the value of training. There was immense value production in the first few decades after independence by civil servants in the form of academic papers and official reports. That culture of value production needs to be re-introduced.
4. Infrastructure of training must improve. Availability of IT infrastructure and learning equipment is a major component of meeting the training needs of officers and these along with access of journals especially those specific to the field of public management need to be made available.
5. Training institutions are considered prestigious in the military. In the civil service postings at these institutions are not considered prestigious. The incentives in place such as higher pay and posting in a bigger city are not enough to attract the best minds to these opportunities. More work ought to be done to improve human resource available at these

institutions on a permanent basis.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
<p>Discussion on proposed amendments to Government Servants (Efficiency and Discipline) Rules, 1973 + Discussion on reference received from Establishment Division on Insertion of Major Penalty for Recovery of Embezzled Money</p>	<p>Mr. Salman Akram Raja outlined that previously four issues had been under discussion with regard to the E&D Rules:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Regulating external accountability intervention of agencies such as NAB ● Definition of <i>efficiency</i> for the purposes of the E&D Rules ● Linking performance management and KPIs to <i>efficiency</i> ● Whether to maintain internal departmental appeal or not <p>Members of the Task Forces were of the opinion that the focus of outside agencies needed to be on mega corruption and clear delineation was required with regard to <i>misuse of authority</i> as this was too broad-based a term. The distinction between a willful defaulter and circumstantial defaulter needed to be taken into account. In this regard, it was observed that there should be a mechanism in place to discern whether a decision stems from bad judgement or willful wrongdoing. There ought to be a difference between procedural irregularity and corruption. However, it was also pointed out that a balance needed to be maintained and any mechanism that is put in place should ensure that the pendulum does not swing to any extreme.</p> <p>Members suggested that it may be possible to create an extra layer of internal scrutiny for civil servants before involving external agencies such as NAB. This could be in the form of investigative committees comprising of bureaucrats under the leadership of the Chief Secretary in the provinces and Federal Secretaries in the</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Mr. Salman Akram Raja to present proposals for strengthening internal accountability so as reduce the need for any outside intervention. Corresponding changes to the NAB Law to be also highlighted. ● A clear distinction needs to be made by accountability agencies to separate procedural irregularity from patent corruption. ● Scrutiny committees at the provincial and federal level, to be headed by the Chief Secretary and relevant Federal Secretary, respectively. These committees would be

capital. These scrutiny committees could rely on collective wisdom and also include law experts, civil society members and retired officers. In cases where there would be a difference of opinion between the findings of such committees and that of external accountability agencies, then the latter would have a mechanism to go into appeal. This would entail that the opinion of the scrutiny committees would not be strictly binding on the outside agency, but would circumscribe the jurisdiction of the accountability agencies. Cases of procedural irregularity could be referred to the scrutiny committees whereas major corruption cases, in particular those concerning mega corruption, could be sent to investigative agencies directly. In this regard, it was suggested that there could be a quantitative threshold in cases of graft with mega corruption referenced directly to organizations such as NAB while smaller offences could be handled by the relevant committee.

On the related topic of potential misuse of authority by both the investigative agencies and by the prospective committees, it was argued that there can be circumscribed limits put in place that would better define jurisdiction for the CS and relevant federal secretary as well as external accountability agencies. It was further advised that room should be created for a second set of eyes to consider requests for inquiry. Someone who is not from the same bureaucracy such as the Auditor General may be a better choice in such matters.

Members lamented that the fear of accountability agencies in the prevailing atmosphere has a major crippling effect at every level of government. Good governance often requires risk taking which has ceased completely in the current scenario. Bureaucrats are afraid of signing off on important documents for fear of being unduly suspected of wrongdoing. In effect this hyper-accountability has become a hurdle in the way of national progress. Since the country functions on the work of bureaucrats and not accountability agencies, it is imperative that work continue in a robust manner. A member pointed out that citizens have a right to information and

contacted by NAB and other investigative agencies if they want to open a case against an officer. The committees would investigate and decide whether a case should be opened or not. The decisions of these committees would be binding unless NAB or other investigative agencies appeal against them.

- Mr. Gulzar Shah, Joint Secretary, Establishment Division to present proposal regarding insertion of major penalty for recovery of embezzled money, in the Government Servants (E&D) Rules. The proposal to be presented in next meeting.

release of reports by relevant departments, especially on websites would help bring in transparency in governance.

A participant of the meeting elaborated on three potential principles. Firstly, instead of accountability, governance ought to be given precedence. Secondly, if an individual has the right and authority to take a decision and does so from among a list of considered/valid decisions, there ought to be no question on that decision. Thirdly, under the current NAB legislation, the accused is considered guilty as the burden of proving innocence is on the accused, instead of the prosecution having to prove guilt. The Chair responded to this line of argument that accountability is an integral part of governance and cannot be separated from it. Furthermore, the onus of providing proof of innocence which is shifted to the accused in the particular case of NAB, is likely to remain in place in its current form.

The Chief Secretary, Punjab informed the members that the NAB Chairman visited Lahore to meet with senior civil servants and solicit their suggestions. The meeting with the Chairman NAB concluded with consensus to create better coordination between the provincial government and the accountability agency. DG NAB Punjab, Additional Chief Secretary and a focal person from Finance will now jointly coordinate with NAB.

The idea of corruption sniffing bots was proposed to introduce Artificial Intelligence in the field of graft detection. The Chair concurred with this proposal and stated that Punjab could be a good place to introduce these bots to see how well they may work practically.

Discussion was also held on a reference received from Establishment Division regarding the proposal to insert recovery of embezzled money as a major penalty in the E&D Rules. Members agreed that there was a major time lag between the time

when an officer is declared an embezzler and recovery of funds is made. Some members believed that the E&D Rules primarily deal with day to day efficiency and discipline and hence the aspects of criminality are not an inherent part of the rules. Members also reflected that recovery of assets can only be done where there is a court order mandating such an action against a convicted embezzler. It was also suggested that since the nature of such activity has to do with the work of the criminal justice system, when an inquiry has been carried out and embezzlement proven, further inquiry could be handed over to the FIA.

AGENDA ITEMS

DISCUSSION

DECISIONS

Discussion on draft of Service Tribunals (Amendment) Bill, 2019

Discussion on the agenda item was deferred to the next meeting.

- Mr. Salman Akram Raja to provide feedback and comments on the proposed amendments, in the next meeting.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
<p>Discussion on placement of Airports Security Force (ASF) under Ministry of Interior or otherwise</p>	<p>Discussion was also held on the reference received from Cabinet Division on whether to place Airports Security Force (ASF) under Aviation Division or transfer it to Interior Division.</p> <p>At the onset, the Chair relayed a concern voiced by the Prime Minister on the number of different agencies that conduct checks on overseas Pakistanis travelling to Pakistan and advised to streamline the process to minimize any harassment of visitors. It was suggested that unifying the scanning procedure at airports could lessen the harassment that visitors may feel. In this case, scanning would be done once but all the different agencies at the airports would have their own monitors whereby they can keep a check individually as per their mandates.</p> <p>Regarding security at the airports, members of the Task Forces were informed that currently, three different agencies i.e. the ASF, Rangers and Police have security functions in and around the airports. The proposal to place ASF under Interior Division was to create better coordination between these agencies as this would provide unity of command. Members were apprised that ASF manages the security within the airport boundaries, whereas Rangers and Police manage outside security. A member informed that it was the requirement of international airlines that airports have proper security in</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Keeping in view that management of airports should be carried out in an integrated manner, the Airports Security Force should continue to be placed under Aviation Division. ● In order to ensure proper security of an area of 12 nautical miles around the airports, a coordination arrangement can be agreed to between the Ministry of Interior and Aviation Division.

place for a radius of 12 nautical miles, hence, the need for placing all security agencies under one umbrella. Suggestions were provided by members of the Task Forces on this matter. It was stated that a possible solution may be to bring all law enforcement agencies such as Rangers, FC and ASF under one body, as this could potentially improve coordination since they would be answerable to the same authority. As such, examples from other countries could be followed like the UK where there are separate inspectorates fulfilling different security functions but they all fall under the same parent ministry i.e. the Home Office and hence their activity is better synced.

With regards to the security management of the 12 nautical miles radius surrounding the airport, suggestions included handing over the law enforcement functions of the area to the ASF as well. However, concerns were voiced stating that this change would require more manpower than currently present and would also require a budget that the ASF does not have. Members also commented that the role of the ASF is not the same as that of other law enforcement agencies, in that it is more specialized since it deals exclusively with airport security. Furthermore, the ASF has to deal with certain particular aspects of security in relation to international flights and airlines that otherwise fall within the purview of the Aviation Division. They urged that given this role, juridical assignment with the Aviation Division would be beneficial for the ASF as it would allow them to better coordinate on matters specific to airport security management.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
<p>Discussion on increasing retirement age for senior civil servants</p>	<p>The Chair initiated the discussion on the matter of increasing the retirement age of senior civil servants. He stated that the retirement age of officers was capped at 60 at a time when life expectancy was in the 60 year range leading to fewer years after retirement. At the time, the average age of officers at induction into the civil service was close to 23-24, providing a span of 35 years in public service. However, in the current scenario the age limit has increased to an average of 28-30 in effect reducing the total number of years of service to around 30 years.</p> <p>The prevailing system fails to take adequate advantage of the cumulative experience gained by capable civil servants over the course of their entire careers. The talent and knowledge of these officers are not being utilized sufficiently . The investment that the government makes in them in the form of providing foreign education and training is also not yielding optimal return.</p> <p>The Chair stated that there may be three ways to consider an increase in the retirement age at this time:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Under the new system, secretaries are appointed by a committee. It can be put into law that an officer can be selected by that committee to become secretary and hold that post for three years even if they attain 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Any final decision on this topic to be made until policy proposals on the performance management system have been finalized and the creation of the National Executive Service is in place.

the retirement age within the stated period.

2. Retirement age for all across the board can be increased from 60 to 62 or 65.
3. Retirement age for officers alone can be increased whereas the retirement age for the staff can remain the same as before.

Members gave their feedback to these suggestions. It was argued that only if the bureaucracy were to open its ranks to outsiders then in that case an increase in the retirement age could be increased. Members also argued that if the age is to be increased, this change would have to be across the board and not selective in nature. In such a case, other institutions including the judiciary would want to institute the same alteration.

The Chair stated that an increase in retirement age would greatly reduce the burden of pensions currently borne by the state. And any such change should only lead to the retention of those who the government wants to keep on in service on the basis of merit. He gave the example of India where under the current system, four federal secretaries of specific ministries are given guaranteed three year tenures even if they reach retirement within the specified period.

Members argued that the country faces a major dilemma with regard to scarcity of good talent in the civil service but if this extension in retirement age is to be made, there ought to be a mechanism in place that would allow for only the very outstanding officers to be accorded this extension. For such a mechanism to be in place, a stronger performance management system would have to be introduced.

The Chair suggested that since the general consensus was on the importance

of retaining the very best of officers, it may be prudent to reserve this debate until after the Task Forces have finalized their ideas on an improved performance management system and until the National Executive Service is in place.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
<p>Update on Governance Reforms in Punjab + Presentation on new Local Government System in Punjab</p>	<p>Mr. Shaukat Ali, Senior Member Board of Revenue, Punjab apprised that the provincial Task Force was up to date on the work done by the Federal Task Forces and has initiated its own deliberations on subjects under review. In particular, the Punjab Task Force is working on areas of induction and training.</p> <p>The Chair stated that proposals of the Federal Task Forces should also be taken up at the provincial level for discussion to suggest improvements. It was stressed that the provincial Task Force can play an important role to translate the proposals into implementable policy. In light of the 18th Amendment and the recent focus on local government particularly within Punjab, it would be advisable if recommendations can be assessed by the provincial Task Force, tailored to the needs of the provincial context and approved by the provincial assemblies and cabinet.</p> <p>Mr. Saif Anjum, Secretary, Local Government, Punjab delivered a detailed presentation on the Local Government Act 2019 recently passed in the province. The Chair stressed on the need to strengthen local governments at the Tehsil level which have largely been neglected in the past. Chief Secretary Punjab commented that while important work has been done by the</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mr. Shaukat Ali to provide detailed update of reforms undertaken in Punjab in the next meeting.

government, a challenge that still exists is to find out how to regulate functions since there is a grave lack of capacity at the local government level. The administrative structure and posts have to be reconsidered and a system created to cater to the newly assigned tasks of local governments.

The Chair commented that this was the first time when taxation and financial powers had been handed over to the local governments and only after granting this kind of financial independence can we expect local governments to progress.

Mr. Anjum started his presentation by explaining that unlike in the past, a lean model has been created for more efficient functioning of government. The local government structure has been extended to both urban and rural settings keeping in mind the importance of reaching the grassroots level most effectively. At the rural level, Tehsil Councils will be set up which will function on the basis of 22,000 Panchayats serving every village within the province. Similarly, at the urban level, Urban Governments have been introduced which shall serve 2400 neighborhoods. The heads of local governments are to be directly elected by the people through elections which will be based on proportional representation. Provisions have also been made to allow mayors to recruit specialists.

The Chair inquired whether this system could potentially be undermined because of old *biradari* or kinship patterns. Mr. Anjum clarified that since the proportional representation system will introduce open listing of candidates and the representation of different political parties in the same government, the *baradari* or kinship patterns will not cripple local governments as they have in the past.

The new system offers greater transparency and predictability. The Punjab Finance Commission which will have the power to allocate funds to governments will have representation of all parties. The number of seats for the opposition have been doubled on the board. The commission will offer criteria based additional funds for under-developed areas. This will ensure that Tehsils and urban centers that have suffered from lower fund allocation (on the basis of population), under-development and neglect over the years will be given funds on preferential basis to develop themselves and be able to compete over time with other local governments. Local governments do not tend to generate their own income and so the Finance Commission has been empowered to introduce ceilings and thresholds for taxation. Additionally, ring fencing powers will be in the hands of the Finance Commission and not the local government. The Chair stated that demand articulation is best done by local people and this autonomy is the biggest advantage of a local government system. Given the provisions for the Finance Commission, these powers may result in the commission micro-managing the financial affairs of the local government and the aim of empowerment at the local level may remain unmet. Representatives of the Punjab government clarified that this remains a debatable topic, however, these powers have been given to the commission to ensure that important areas such as education and health that require funding are not ignored.

The Chair stated that local governments which have to function on the demands of the local people can often come to identify efficient, cost-effective solutions. Managing things from provincial capitals does not always allow for informed decisions since those who are not functioning at the local level may be lacking in crucial information about the local context. In response, it was clarified that the Finance Commission will have four representatives from the local government and an equal number each from the provincial government

and experts from the field. Also, once the territorial limits of local governments have been demarcated, the next delimitation of areas cannot be done for at least another two elections.

Yardstick competition has been introduced in this system with the hope to improve local government performance. The intention is to create an atmosphere of healthy competition between local governments. Fiscal transfers will be made on the basis of poverty and under-development in the areas concerned. To ensure that smaller, under-developed units do not face the burden of competing with richer areas far ahead in development and service-provision, fiscal performance will be weighed against fiscal potential. Inspectorates with expertise in specific areas are to be formed to measure local government performance against defined thresholds in that domain. The Chair cautioned that it is important to ensure that these newly formed inspectorates do not function in the same manner as the existing inspectorates have performed. Members discussed that as far as urban governance is concerned, municipal authorities have failed in the past to enforce regulations on multi-story buildings. This gap in enforcement has to be filled.

Mr. Anjum stated that for municipal government, the powers over WASA, TEPA and PHA will all go to the Mayors and they will have complete autonomy to run affairs independently. In terms of city expansion, in the prevailing scenario we see the unchecked expansion of cities without the subsequent expansion of legal boundaries and jurisdictions. Due to this expansion, there are vast unserved and untaxed areas in our cities which have to be demarcated properly and brought under local government jurisdiction. Once this is done, these areas will be taxed and developed. There is a need for better coordination between multiple entities and jurisdictions within and beyond local government boundaries. The plan allows for better coordination between local

governments and Cantonment Boards. Efficient land use planning will require a provincial level agency in the form of a supra regulator that can inform on the utilization and demarcation of both intra and intercity spaces.

Mr. Anjum stated that for the success of this plan, people will have to be recruited from the mainstream civil service. Experts from different domains should also be allowed to contribute to the local governments. The Chair commended the government on drafting this ambitious plan and reinforced the need for very good human resource in order to make this plan successful.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
Formation of Sub-Group on Local Government Administrative Architecture to support the new Local Government System	<p>The Chair stressed on the importance of having an administrative architecture that would be able to effectively support the new local government setup in Punjab.</p> <p>As such a Sub-Group is to be formed that would come up with proposals in this regard, as well as coordinate with the different provincial departments and the provincial Task Force.</p> <p>Mr. Saif Anjum, Secretary Local Government, Punjab informed that two committees at the level of the Additional Chief Secretary as well as at that of the provincial Cabinet have been formed to oversee the transition period. The Chair advised that the Sub-Group being formed should coordinate with these committees as well.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The composition of the Sub-Group on Local Government Administrative Architecture is as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mr. Shahid Kardar (convener) - Mr. Ali Cheema - Mr. Umair Javed - Mr. Burhan Rasool - Mr. Saif Anjum, Secretary Local Government, Punjab

*_*_*_*_*