MINUTES OF THE MEETING
16th JOINT MEETING OF THE TASK FORCES ON
CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS AND AUSTERITY & RESTRUCTURING OF GOVERNMENT

Date: Friday, 17th January, 2020
Time: 10:00 am to 5:00 pm
Venue: Prime Minister's Office, Islamabad
Chairman of the meeting: Dr. Ishrat Husain
Advisor to the Prime Minister on Institutional Reforms and Austerity

List of the participants:

Mr. Abdullah Yousaf **Member Task Force**	Dr. Safdar Sohail **SpecialSecretary**, **Cabinet**	Dr. Muhammad Akif **Deputy Coordinator, PMRU**
Mr. Asad Ali Shah **Member Task Force**	Mr. Shabahat Ai Shah **CEO, NITB**	Mr. Adeel Khalid **UNDP**
Ms. Naheed ShahDurrani **Member Task Force**	Dr. Arshad Mahmood **Additional Secretary, Ministry of Finance**	Mr. Umar Nadeem **UNDP**
Mr. Nadeem Ul Haq **Member Task Force**	Mr. Awais Manzur Sumra **Additional Secretary,EstablishmentDivision**	Mr.Javed Sikander **Chief, Ministry of Planning Development and Reforms**
Ms.Aisha Farooq **Member Task Force**	Dr. Hafeez Jamali, Additional Secretary **Government of Balochistan**	Madam Beenish Fatima **AS (School Education Department Punjab)**
Mr. Syed Nadeem Hussain Rizvi **Member Task Force**	Mr. Aslam Ghauri, Secretary TMR Wing **Government of Sindh**	Mr. Qamar Zaman **Joint Secretary, IRC**
Mr. Muhammad Tahir **Member Task Force**	Noman Afridi **Government of KPK**	Dr. Amir Hussain **Deputy Secretary, IRC**
Mr. Salman Akram Raja **Member Task Force**	Muhammad Ilyas **Government of Punjab**	Dr. Altamash Janjua **Deputy Secretary, IRC**
Mr. Burhan Rasool **Member Task Force**	Mr. Shahid Sheikh **Dean NSPP**	Mr. Najeebullah Khan **Deputy Secretary, IRC**

Agenda:

- **Discussion on up-gradation of Establishment Division into a Human Resource Management Division**
- **Discussion on draft of Government Servants Efficiency and Discipline Rules, 2019**
- **Progress/Update on implementation of Cabinet decisions on Training and Performance Management of Civil Servants.**
- **Presentation on Performance Management and Reform Unit of KP Government**
- **Progress review on E-Government by NITB**
- **Progress review on Public Financial Management (PFM) Law**
- **Presentation on E-transfer of school teachers in Punjab**

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
Up-gradation of Establishment Division into a Human Resource Management Division	Additional Secretary Establishment Division informed the chair that the Establishment Division has engaged a Consultant, who has shared first draft on up-gradation of Establishment Division into Human Resource Management Division. To present the first draft, he invited the consultant to make a presentation to the Task Force Members. The consultant started the presentation and explained the following roadmap to achieve its goal: • Mapping the Journey (Transformation Blueprint) In this phase, mapping and documentation of existing Organizational Structures, HR Functions and Processes within Establishment and other divisions will be undertaken which will be followed by design stage where future roles and responsibilities between HRD and line ministers will be designed. Lastly, based upon mapping and design stage, work plan will be chalked out for implementation. • Ensuring Ownership: (Consultations & Decisions) In second phase, active collaboration with line ministries will be started and their input will be solicited. If required, changes will be made in the structure to incorporate inputs and ensure institutional alignment. Lastly, formal approval will be sought to initiate the implementation process. • Executing the Plan: (Pilot & Scale-up) In the execution stage, the module will be implemented only in Establishment Division and two divisions to get insight for future scale up. Upon successful implementation, the module will be replicated in other divisions which will be continuously monitored and tracked for any issues. Regular monitoring reports will be generated and challenges/bottlenecks will be shared with concerned authorities/committee/ task force, etc. • Adaptive Learning: Continuous Redesign & Deployment	*The Task Force decide to form a subcommittee as per following composition:* • *Ms. Naheed Durrani* • *Mr. Asad Ali Shah* • *Mr. Burhan Rasool* • *Mr. Awais Manzur Sumara, AS Establishment Division (focal person)* *The subcommittee will review the scope of the major TORs of the consultants and will provide them guidance during the exercise. Establishment Division will also liaise with PMRU KPK to benefit from the system developed by them.*

	During and post implementation stage, line ministries will be engaged proactively to explore client experience and to identify innovations and evolve HR practices for the benefit of all ministries/division. In this whole process, technology roadmap will be aligned with the strategic objectives and overall transformation plan of ministries/divisions.	
	During the presentation, the chair asked AS, Establishment Division whether or not, Establishment Division gave clear cut concept to the consultant regarding the needs and objectives of the Division to which he replied in agreement. The chair asked the consultant about the timelines for the task. The consultant replied that it has not been finalized since this is the first draft. In reply to it, the chair stated that as reform is a continuous process, it would be the responsibility of HRM Division to steer the reforms process once, the Task Force completes their task. The sooner the new HRM Division comes alive, the better-off, we would be. Dr. Asad Ali Shah also emphasized that timelines should be realistic and be followed in letter and spirit. Special Secretary, Cabinet enquired about the theory of change. The consultant replied that they want to identify quick entry points for transformation and automation. Madam Naheed Durrani stated that some services/ministries already have their own efficient HR systems, and it would be advisable to integrate and interface them with the new HRM Division. The chair replied that the government needs uniform HR policy for all cadres, non-cadres and ex-cadres with centralized data bank in Establishment Division. The chair further added that policy, standards, norms and processes have to be centralized but its execution will be decentralized. Madam Aisha Farooq informed the participants that FBR has already developed HR model and if needed, FBR can extend its help in the process.	

Discussion on draft of Government Servants Efficiency and Discipline Rules, 2019	The chair intimated the participants that Establishment Division informed the Prime Minister that they have already submitted draft of E and D Rules to the Task Forces but it has not been finalized yet. The chair emphasized that the members of the Task Forces may discuss the matter to finalize it. In order to attend meeting at the PM House, the chair left the meeting and Mr. Abdullah Yousaf presided the meeting. The Task Force members had a lengthy discussion on the E and D Rules by focusing on the definition of word "inefficiency" and attaching it with performance evaluation and conduct rules. Madam Naheed Durrani stated that government is impacted more due to inefficiency of employees than corruption. Dr Asad Ali Shah was of the opinion that there has to be a combined framework on performance management, conduct and efficiency rules. Madam Aisha pointed out that not attending a mandatory training/course is considered to be inefficiency but there is no exemption clause in the rules defining that in which condition the training course may not be attended like illness, unavoidable situations, etc. A member from KP government stated that we may devise the rules in a way that no one is victimized due to personal bias. Member form the Balochistan government informed the participants that "inefficiency" has a circular definition and may be linked with performance management. Dr. Nadeem ul Haq opined that efficiency is indeed performance evaluation. Another aspect of the discussion was that since E&D Rules are incident based, the element of efficiency may be separated and attached with conduct rules. Regarding the conduct rules, Additional Secretary, Establishment Division informed the participants that work on Conduct Rules is already going on that it will be presented in the next meeting.	*The Task Force recommended that 'inefficiency' as a broader concept may be addressed in Conduct Rules (which are under revision in Establishment Division) as a part of Performance Management. E& D Rules, on the other hand, may be restricted to cater for the incidence-based indiscipline, violations etc. In this regard, the following subcommittee will review the draft E&D Rules and present the final draft in next meeting of the Task Force:* • *Mr. Salman Akram Raja* • *Ms. Aisha Farooq* • *Mr. Awais Manzur Sumra, Additional Secretary, Establishment Division*

		(focal person) *It was further decided that Establishment Division will present revised draft of Conduct Rules also in the next meeting after incorporating the concepts of 'inefficiency' and 'performance management'.*
Progress/Update on implementation of Cabinet decisions on Training and Performance Management of Civil Servants.	Dean NSPP provided the feedback on training. It was stated that for post-induction training, NSPP has identified six areas and 6 weeks is sufficient training time. Regarding the pre-induction training, it was suggested that it may be done in one place that is CSA with four to six weeks' course. It was pointed out that the recruitment of different occupational groups in grade 17 is made once in a year, through CSS; on the other hand, recruitment of ex-cadre remains under process throughout the year and that too in grade 16 to 20. NSPP can run separate courses for grade 17-18 and 19-20 officers of ex-cadre. The chair inquired as to why the NSPP is providing new suggestions now once the decision has been taken by the Cabinet? The Dean informed the chair that Establishment division sought input of NSPP which he has presented accordingly. The chair stated that once Cabinet decides anything it has to be implemented generally, and it is not advisable to revert back to Cabinet seeking amendment / modification in the decision.	*Establishment Division may revisit the views of NSPP and present progress review to the Task Forces and if required, before the Cabinet.*
Presentation on Performance Management and	Deputy Coordinator from KP Government gave a detailed presentation on Performance Management and Reform Unit and shared their experience with the chair and Task Force members. The participants were informed that PMRU has vision: "Welfare of the Citizens" and the methodology is "Measure to Manage" with the following principles:	*Establishment Division to coordinate with PMRU and seek their assistance and expertise for*

| Reform Unit of KP Government | i. Culture of quantified performance management
ii. Promote transparency and accountability
iii. Improve service delivery
iv. Promote e-governance; use of digital technologies

Performance Management Systems works on the principle of bottom-up and top-down approaches. On one hand, the system connects district governments, provincial departments and citizens and generates performance reports and analysis for Chief Secretary. On the other hand, Policy guidelines and tasks trickle down to the district governments and provincial departments from the Chief Secretary. The Chief Secretary's dash board presents graphical and tabular data regarding various departments, districts and citizens' complaints like price control, administrative inspections, khulli kacheri, land acquisition cases, redressal of grievances of citizens, etc. It was further informed that data from various districts are retrieved from various performance management systems and are integrated to give Relative Performance Scorecard. On this basis, every district in the KP has its scorecard which is available on dash board for comparison and intervention, if required. In the same manner, the performance of officer is gauged by integrating the data retrieved from various systems. Thus, the performance of officers in measured and managed at various tiers of government through performance management systems to achieve good governance in the province.

The presenter also shed light on the following initiatives of PMRU which have resulted to achieve good governance through the use of digital technologies;

Government Productivity
i. HR System (ePerformance)
ii. File Tracking System
iii. Litigation Management System
iv. Task Management System
v. Case Tracking System | *the possibility of replicating the already established systems/applications at the level of Federal Government. It also agreed that there is no need for the duplication of the effort by engaging the consultant and doing the entire need assessment and diagnosis. Establishment Division may try replicating the intervention made by Reform Unit of KP and making suitable modifications, if warranted.* |

	vi. Land Record Monitoring System vii. Internship Portal viii. Vehicle Management System **Service Delivery** ix. Citizen Portal x. E-Domicile xi. Inspections Management System xii. Revenue Case Management System xiii. Price Control System xiv. Khulli Kachehri Another important area of interest to the Task Force was Human Resource Management System. The participants were informed that HRM system of PMRU has centralized record of government officers like bio-data, academic background, trainings and previous postings, details of enquiries, etc. The system generates profile card of officers for higher authorities to take decision regarding posting and transfers, promotions, etc. Postings and transfers are done through the system which generates notification on official web portal and transfer notification message is also sent on the mobile number of the officer. It was interesting to note that task management, the complete process of promotion selection boards (e-PSBs), annual confidential reports (e-ACRs) and enquiries against the officers (e-Enquiries) are managed through the HRM systems resulting in efficiency and transparency. The presenter emphasized that Pension tracking system has provided ease and facility to retiring employees because the system has database of the retiring employees and generates all relevant record, papers and calculations required for claiming the pension. The presenter offered that the PMRU was ready and willing to provide technical assistance to the federal government and can even replicate the established systems/applications in the federal government free of cost.	

	The chair, task force members and other participants appreciated the work done by PMRU and suggested that federal government may avail the expertise of the PMRU and replicate the systems/applications for which there is no cost. In this way, both time and money will be saved.	
E-Government	CEO NITB gave the presentation on E-Government. At the very outset, it was stated that NITB's vision is the use of technology to do the following tasks: ➢ eliminate corruption with accountability and enhanced transparency ➢ extend tax base ➢ generate foreign revenue To achieve the above goal, Central Digital Automation Platform will act as Data Nervous System connecting the government and citizens. On government side, it will ensure and track transparency within the ministries/divisions; whereas, on the citizens' side, it will ensure transparency into Citizen-Government Transactions. Regarding the E-office which is the flagship initiative of MoIT & NITB and is aligned with GoP's vision of employing digitization/e-Government, the participants were informed that currently 14 ministries/departments are at level 4 whereas eight ministries/departments number as at level 0. NITB's first priority is to at least bring all ministries and allied departments at level 2 for which they are facing budgetary issues. On this, AS (Finance) replied that it has already released Rs. 11 Million and Rs.100 Million. Regarding the new version of E-office, it was informed that Ministry of Information Technology and Telecommunications has filed case against the vendor/company. CEO NITB suggested that MoIT and T may take its case back so that new version of E-office is got hold of and tested. Regarding E-commerce, it was informed that Pakistan's e-Commerce industry is emerging rapidly and has the potential to strengthen country's economy and NITB will implement National e-commerce policy throughout the Pakistan which will its exports exponentially. The participants were also informed about the following projects/plans/activities of NITB:	*NITB will review the e-office applications developed by PMRU KPK and will compare it with the latest version of e-office of LMKT with a view to accessing the suitability of the former for its adoption at Federal level as a cost-effective method.* *NITB will also coordinate with PMRU for benefiting from their experience in developing applications other than e-office.*

	- PSDP Proposed Projects of NITB - Citizen Services - City Islamabad App - Pakistan Citizen Portal - Kamyab Jawan - eProcurement - ERP System – Federal Govt. - Durust Daam – Price Control App - M&Es System – Task Tracking System - Baytee Mobile App - Mera Bacha - OPR Online Registration System - Automation of Ehsaas Program - Digital Lockers - E-Health Dr. Asad Ali Shah suggested that NITB should be under PM office and E-office be used at PM office to give it ownership so the federal government/ministries may adopt it on fast track. On this the chair informed that there are two nature of cases; secret and routine matters. The routine matters can go on E-office. Mr. Burhan Rasool suggested that government may adopt KP model as it is free and easy to be replicated. When CEO NITB informed the participants that NITB has only 45 people to cater for the needs of all ministries/division, Madam Aisha Farooq stated that NITB may benefit from the achievements and interventions made by KP government in E-Government.	
Public Financial Management (PFM) Law	Additional Secretary Finance, presented progress review and implementation of the Public Financial Management (PFM) Law. The short, medium- and long-term initiatives were detailed for the task forces. He stated that the most critical interventions in the PFM Law are the Cash Management and Treasury Single Account policies which were approved in	*● The Chair directed the Finance Division to make a presentation before the Secretaries Committee on the*

	June 2019 and are under implementation. Multi-stakeholder engagement was carried out to create a plan on the implementation of TSA, following which the PFM Law has been sent to all PAO's. Rules relevant to both policies have been circulated to the National Bank of Pakistan and State Bank of Pakistan among others. The next step for the Finance Division is to initiate implementation of TSA-1 which is planned to be completed by September 2020. In addition, the Budget Manual has now been made available online and forwarded to all stakeholders. The Mid-Year Review on the Budget is scheduled to be tabled before parliament by the end of February 2020 whereas the Budget Strategy Paper will be approved by the Cabinet by Mid-March 2020 and uploaded on the Finance Division website. Work on the latter is currently under process. It was also noted that since the disbanding of the Financial Advisors' Organization, the role of CF&AOs as well as internal auditors is currently being conceptualized and will be presented in an approach paper upon finalization. A draft of the 'Delegation of Financial Powers' is also under process through multi-stakeholder engagement pending finalization and issuance. The Chair stressed that the Finance Division should make a presentation to the Secretaries Committee for further clarification on the delegation of financial powers. AS(Finance) also identified areas in the PFM Law that will require changes in established rules and systems including the GFR, TR and SR, System of Delegation of Financial Powers, New Accounting Model and the Manual for Development Projects. A committee is being formulated which will update subsidiary legislation affected by the PFM Law. Additionally, deliberations are currently underway regarding the formation of a Fiscal Policy Unit within the Finance Division. The Division may also seek technical assistance to carry out a functional review of the role, structure and skill set needed within the ministry.	*delegation of financial powers.* • *The Chair advised that the CGA MIS should not be converted into a company instead it should be kept within the Finance ministry as a separate wing.* • *Implementation of TSA to be initiated by Finance Division and completed by September 2020.* • *Finance Division is to provide a rundown of the timelines for the connectivity of IFMIS with other self-accounting entities.*

	Meetings and deliberations are also being held to make improvements towards data gathering and reporting through the SAP system. Studies have been conducted to advise on improving IFMIS connectivity with Pakistan Railways, Pak PWD, PPOD and CDNS. He apprised that there is a proposal to convert to convert CGA – MIS into a company. The Chair advised that on this matter it would be best to keep CGA-MIS as a separate wing within the Finance ministry.	
Presentation on E-Transfer of school teachers in Punjab	Additional Secretary, School Education Department, Punjab, (SED) gave presentation to the Task Forces. The presentation provided an overview of the digitization of work done by the department with particular focus on the e-transfer of teachers across the province. The SED is the second largest organization within the country and manages the public education system for all districts of the Punjab. Close to 90% of the SED's time is spent on HR activities of which close to 60% are spent on transfers and postings alone. Approximately 100,000 teachers apply for transfer annually with 50,000 transfers made by the SED in the last year on behalf of 100 different approving authorities functioning in 36 districts of Punjab. It was in light of this that the department pushed to digitize the system as much as possible to reduce the amount of time officers and staff spent on catering to transfer/posting activities. In addition to making the process more seamless, digitization has also introduced more transparency and merit. For teachers, the e-Transfer system offers a more systematic process that is reliable and enforces timelines while reducing in-person visits. The lack of human interface allows for the avoidance of favoritism and has also reduced bribery and corruption in the process. Since e-Transfer allows procedural work throughout the year, it also avoids back log at any particularly busy time of the year. SED has implemented the School Information System across all public schools in Punjab	*The Task Force noted and appreciated the progress of School Education Department Punjab in adopting and implementing the Standardized Schools Information System (SIS) and e-transfers policy of teachers.*

| | which registers students and teachers at their schools and allows administrations to self-report data on enrollment, facilities, budgets and posts. Teacher data provided through this app can then be cross-matched against databases of NADRA AND PIFRA. The smart phone app allows teachers' access to their SIS records as it provides them with individual accounts from which they can 'Apply for Transfer' as well. As with most online applications, the app allows teachers to list 5 preferences for transfer, puts them on an automatic waitlist, verifies their documentation and prompts upon final decision on application. According to the system, information on vacancies is available to teachers who are matched to the schoolsnearby. Due to its digital nature, the process now entirely bypasses the clerk mafia that was once very strong and has standardized the process for the entire province. Furthermore, the system is designed to block transfer to schools with surplus teachers and also block transfer from schools with a minimum of 5 teachers.

It was noted that these changes have improved quality and performance management as well as, has transformed the system from monitoring to mentoring. Assistant Education Officers have been hired who are able to assist teachers on lesson planning, teaching strategies and training through the app. Furthermore, the SED has most recently finished the 5th standard exams and is now developing internal assessment mechanisms for individual schools.

The task force members congratulated the representatives of the SED on their successful initiatives and lauded them for incorporating technological ease in their reforms. It was stated that similar initiatives for other provinces would be advisable to create more transparent, efficient and meritocratic systems of public education across the country. | |
|---|---|---|