

MEETING MINUTES

TASK FORCE ON AUSTERITY MEASURES & GOVERNMENT RESTRUCTURING – FIRST MEETING

Date: 14th September, 2018

Time: 2:30 pm to 5:30 pm

Venue: Prime Minister's Secretariat, Islamabad

The first meeting of the working group was held at the Prime Minister's Secretariat with Dr. Ishrat Hussain as "Chair" along with representatives from the public and private sector [*Member list - Annex I*].

1. There was general consensus between the members that this Task Force is not working on austerity for the sake of austerity - the core objective is to make the government lean, efficient and responsive.
 - The table [*Size of the Government and Wage Bill from 2008 - Annex II*] was well received as a good example of the inefficient state of the government; the table exhibited that the "headcount and wage bill of BPS 1 to 16 officers" accounted for 96% of the headcount and 85% of the wage bill. The "Chair" proposed that the solution is to reverse the lopsided structure and reallocate resources [wage bill savings] from BPS 1 to 16 to BPS 17 to 22.
 - **Action:** The "Chair" requested representatives of the provinces to provide information to update the table with latest figures.

2. Members of the Task Force agreed to the 5 criteria's [*Annex III*] devised by the "Chair" to restructure the federal government and propose it to the Federal Cabinet. Details on the 5 criteria's are provided in Annex III, however a summary is provided below:
 - i. Focus areas and areas of emphasis in the manifesto and the PM's public statements
 - ii. Constitutional obligations and serve as the touch points with other organs of state
 - iii. Cross-cutting service required for the functioning of the Government as a whole
 - iv. Main instruments needed for external and internal security and national harmony
 - v. Key drivers for promoting economic growth
 - **Action:** The "Chair" will initiate work on the revised structure of the federal government; which will be shared with the Task Force in the next meeting

3. Members of the Task Force agreed with the immense potential of IT to make Government business processes efficient. Furthermore, there was agreement on the need to improve Public Finance Management to reduce wastage and improve allocation of resources. The discussion led on to the formation of 2 subgroups to deliver on the objective of the Task Force.
 - i. Subgroup 1: E-Governance [Burhan Rasool, Asad Ali Shah and Rana Ahmed]
 - ii. Subgroup 2: Public Finance Management [Abdullah Yusuf, Asad Ali Shah and Javed Sikander]
 - The “Chair” has identified 3 resources, one from each; NADRA, PIFRA and NITB to support the subgroups. **Action:** Saad Tamman will share the details of the resources with subgroup members.
 - **Action:** Both subgroups will present their initial findings, strategy and recommendations along with a future work plan in the 2nd session of the Task Force, scheduled on 27th September.
4. During the course of the session, members of the Task Force agreed on the following for effective delivery against the ToRs.
 - i. Build on existing work done and focus on implementation plan
 - ii. Prioritize quick wins for implementation e.g. empowering 22 Grade Officers to utilize operational budget without approval of Finance Ministry unless it involves the appropriation of assets
 - iii. Involve experts with consent of the “Chair” to improve output quality and delivery speed
 - iv. Engage provinces to support the effort by identifying areas for improvement –

Action: Chief Secretaries / Additional Chief Secretaries of all provinces to identify opportunities to reduce wastage and duplication of work across provinces and also to improve business process efficiency and Govt. responsiveness.
5. Sameena Zehra is appointed as the committee secretary; her contact details are
 - Contact #: +92 333 3528950
 - Email: zehrasamina@hotmail.com

**PARTICIPANTS – FIRST MEETING OF TASK FORCE ON AUSTERITY
MEASURES & GOVERNMENT RESTRUCTURING**

Chair: Dr. Ishrat Hussain

Name	Current Designation	Contact #	Email
Salman Siddique	Former Finance Secretary	923214187777	salmansiddique5@gmail.com
Ijaz Nabi	Country Director, IGC	923005008317	ijaz.nabi@gmail.com
Burhan Rasool	General Manager, Punjab IT Board	923214668864	burhan.rasool@gmail.com
Abdullah Yusuf	Former Chairman FBR	923005554747	abdullahyusuf48@gmail.com
Rana Ahmad	Member FBR	923008401365	ahmed.raana@gmail.com
Asad Ali Shah	Former Managing Partner Deloitte	923008290078	aashah@deloitte.com
Tasnim Aslam	Former Foreign Secretary	923350555058	tasmin.aslam@mofa.gov.pk
Javed Sikander	Chief - Reforms - Planning and Development	923336519044	javedsikander@yahoo.com
Ahmad Mujtaba Memon	Additional Finance Secretary	923314455510	mujtabamemon1@gmail.com
Ijaz Munir	Secretary Establishment or nominee	923211111625	ijazmunir@gmail.com
Dr. Akhter Nazir	Chief Secretary, Balochistan	923000806070	csbalochistan@yahoo.com
Akbar H Durrani	Additional Chief Secretary Punjab	+923040920000 / 042 99213116	pacspb@gmail.com
Shahzad Khan Bangash	Additional Chief Secretary KP	923339299713	psacskp@gmail.com

Members who were not able to attend the first meeting			
Wajid Rana	Former Finance Secretary	923365440040	awrana.rana@gmail.com
Roshaneh Zafar	M.D. Kashf Foundation	923008447011	roshaneh.zafar@kashf.org
Tariq Khosa	Former Federal Secretary	923005554786	tariqkhosa@gmail.com
Arif Ahmed Khan	Secretary Finance	923212223544	secretary@finance.gov.pk
Azam Suleman Khan	Chief Secretary Sindh	923028881999	hsmail1940@gmail.com
Naveed Karmran Baluch	Chief Secretary KP	923023528950	nkbaloch@hotmail.com

Secretary of the Task Force: Sameena Zehra

Member – Prime Minister’s Reform Team: Saad Hayat Tamman

SIZE OF THE GOVERNMENT AND WAGE BILL - 2008**SIZE OF THE GOVERNMENT**

Government	Total Strength	Strength BPS 1-16	Strength BPS 1-5	% BPS 1-16 in total	% BPS 1-15 in total
Pakistan federal govt. excluding military	622,676	601,361	354,931	96.8%	57.0%
Punjab	1,108,096	1,043,826	433,102	94.2%	39.1%
Sindh	504,440	466,513	208,967	92.5%	41.4%
KP	327,974	310,952	157,932	94.8%	48.2%
Balochistan	201,480	186,963	98,912	92.8%	49.1%
AJK	76,762	69,449	34,160	90.5%	44.5%
Total	2,841,428	2,679,064	1,288,004	94.3%	45.3%

WAGE BILL OF THE GOVERNMENT

Government	Total wage bill Rs. Billion	Wage bill BPS 1-16 Rs. Billion	Wage bill BPS 1-5 Rs. Billion	% BPS 1-16 in total	% BPS 1-15 in total
Pakistan federal govt. excluding military	88.7	79.4	39.6	89.5%	44.6%
Punjab	178.5	152.6	47.1	85.5%	26.4%
Sindh	80.5	65	22.9	80.7%	28.4%
KP	50.3	43.5	16.8	86.6%	33.4%
Balochistan	30.5	24.6	10.8	80.6%	35.4%
AJK	12.5	9.5	3.8	76.3%	30.2%
Total	441.0	374.5	140.9	84.9%	32.0%

CRITERIA ADOPTED FOR THE PROPOSED RESTRUCTURING OF THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT

1. Which Ministries are identified as the focus areas and areas of emphasis in the manifesto and the PM's public statements?

Human Development, Technology Development, Human Rights & Social Protection, Water Resources, Climate Change & Food Security, Overseas Pakistanis.

2. Which Ministries have to perform the constitutional obligations and serve as the touch points with other organs of state?

Parliamentary Affairs (Parliament), Law and Justice along with Attorney General (Judiciary), Inter-Provincial Coordination (Provinces).

3. Which Ministries provide cross-cutting service required for the functioning of the Government as a whole?

Cabinet Division, Finance, Revenue and Economic Affairs, Foreign Affairs, Law & Justice, Human Resource Management, Information & Media.

4. Which Ministries are the main instruments needed for external and internal security and national harmony?

Defence and Defence Production, Interior and Narcotics Control, National Security, Religious Affairs and Inter Faith Harmony, Foreign Affairs.

5. Which Ministries are the key drivers for promoting economic growth?

Finance, Revenue and Economic Affairs, Human Developments, Infrastructure Development, Energy Development, Trade and Industry, Food Security, Water resources, Technology Development, Planning, Development and Statistics.