

MINUTES OF THE MEETING

JOINT MEETING OF THE TASK FORCES ON CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS AND AUSTERITY AND RESTRUCTURING GOVERNMENT

Date: 14thDecember, 2018
 Time: 10:00 am to 05:00 pm
 Venue: Darbar Hall, Civil Secretariat, Islamabad

The 6th meeting of the Task Forces on Civil Services Reform and Austerity and Restructuring Government was jointly held at Civil Secretariat, Lahore under the chair of Dr. Ishrat Hussain. Following is a re-cap of the key areas of discussion and decisions.

AGENDA ITEMS	DISCUSSION	DECISIONS
Consultative Sessions with Various Groups of Civil Servants	Chair informed the Task Force members that as per the decision taken in the 2 nd meeting of the Task Force on CSR, consultative sessions were being held with various groups of civil servants to ensure diverse and broad-based feedback. Members were informed that a total of 984 representatives belonging to various groups of civil servants in Lahore, Karachi, Peshawar and Islamabad had so far been consulted and the	It was viewed that consultations were useful in dispelling misgivings regarding the reform process and a valuable source of meaningful input to be placed before the Task Forces for consideration. Accordingly, future meetings in Quetta on the 19 th

	details were shared with the members.	and 20 th Dec, 2018 and Lahore on 24 th Dec, 2018 were to be taken in the same spirit.
Update on the Summaries Already Under Consideration by the Cabinet	Chair apprised the Task Force members regarding the progress on the summaries, on the proposals approved by the Task Force, which have already been submitted to the Cabinet, i.e., Security of Tenure of Civil Servants, Appointments of Heads of Key Organizations Under Federal Government and Role of Secretaries Committee.	None
Amendments in the Federal Government Rules of Business	The sub-group of the Task Force on Austerity and Restructuring Government presented proposed amendments in the federal government Rules of Business. It was emphasized that at this stage, the amendments proposed were meant to correct the fundamentals with a view to bring the rules of business in conformity with the Constitution and the relevant judgments of the Honorable Supreme Court of Pakistan. It was also informed that the proposals of the Cabinet Division regarding the amendments in Rules of Business shared vide their U.O. No. 4-2/2016-Min-I dated 20 th November, 2018 have also been duly considered by the sub-group.	After thorough deliberation by the Task Forces on each proposed amendment, the proposals presented were approved with some minor modifications. It was further decided that these proposals would be clubbed with the proposals of the sub-group working on redefining the roles of Secretary and Minister in Rules of Business. The joint

	<p>Members were briefed that the amendments were being proposed keeping the following in perspective:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Aligning the Rules of business with the Constitution and the principles enunciated by the Supreme Court in its judgment2. Alleviating some of the administrative burdens and the delays faced at the secretarial and ministerial level3. Introducing clarifications wherever required for smooth functioning of the Federal government <p>It was apprised that the changes proposed in the existing Rules of Business relate primarily to the first point above in terms of aligning the role of the Cabinet and the Prime Minister while ensuring effective decision-making. It was further briefed that the working of the government is complex, to say the least, so in terms of immediate reforms, it is best to veer on the conservative side and create space through initial “wins” for future change.</p>	<p>set of amendments would then be circulated to all ministries/divisions and the Secretaries’ Committee to solicit their views before presenting the same for consideration of the Cabinet.</p>
--	---	--

<p>Proposals of the Sub-group on Induction / Recruitment & Training / Learning</p>	<p>The sub-group of the Task Force on Civil Services Reforms on Induction/Recruitment & Training /Learning presented its final proposals. Principles of reforming the recruitment process and induction and final proposals were put forth by the sub-group which were discussed in detail. The sub-group proposed that the induction process needed to test three distinct aspects for CE recruitment:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Problem-solving, Analytical, and Articulation ability 2. Aptitude and Motivation 3. Domain-specific knowledge <p>It was apprised that currently, FPSC examiners must go through all sections of nearly 11,000 candidates appearing for the CE. A consistent proposal for this issue would be to introduce a screening test to filter out weaker and non-serious candidates. It was informed that the three stages of CE recruitment were being proposed based on the rationale that FPSC had shown an interest in introducing screening test and psychometric testing and that the reforms were in line with international best practices. Following specific proposals were put forth by the sub-group for</p>	<p>After thorough deliberations by the Task Forces, the proposals presented to the Task Forces by the sub-group were approved in principle with the decision that these proposals would be shared with the Chairman and Members of FPSC to seek their input and buy-in on the proposed reforms.</p>
---	--	---

	<p>consideration by the Task Forces:</p> <p>1. Stage 1 (Screening)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">I. The existing compulsory section of the Competitive Exam should be converted into a stand-alone problem-solving and analytical ability testing component, along the lines of a standardized exam (SAT/GRE).II. Include coverage of subjects such as Pakistan Studies and Islamic Studies, but should primarily be used to test candidates' ability to solve basic logical and mathematical problems, as well as English language comprehension.III. An additional English composition section can also be added to test the candidate's articulation ability. <p>2. Stage 1 (II)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">I. The compulsory section should be administered separately.II. Performance/outcome in the compulsory section will be valid for three years, along the lines of other standardized tests.III. A passing threshold can be established that can be used to determine eligibility for other testing components.	
--	--	--

	<p>3. Stage 2 (Psychometric Testing)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> I. Candidates clearing the compulsory exam will be subjected to a range of psychometric evaluations to determine their aptitude and motivation towards government service; II. These exercises can draw in from the experience of generalist recruitment in the UK civil services, where candidates take several sets of psychometric tests; III. Perry Public Service Motivation test is recommended, which determines pro-social motivation of civil servants. <p>4. Stage 3 (Domain Specific Knowledge)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> I. Candidates who clear the second stage of evaluation can then sit for a range of domain-specific optional exam clusters. II. Candidates can appear for as many optional exam clusters as they prefer, but successful allocation to linked occupational groups can only happen if a candidate has appeared for its respective cluster. III. Sub-group proposed three clusters – Public Administration (PAS, PSP, OMG, PG, MLCG, RCTG), Public Finance, Commerce, and Trade (IRS, PCS, PAAS, C&T), and Foreign Service 	
--	--	--

	<p>(FSP).</p> <p>IV. Level of knowledge testing in each cluster will be at introductory university level. Elective and compulsory subjects in each cluster would be designed to reflect the basic domain knowledge. There will be no restrictions on the qualifications for eligibility to appear in the examination clusters.</p>	
<p>Analysis of Performance Management, Promotion and Career Planning System by the Relevant Sub-Group</p>	<p>Presentation by the sub-group of the Task Force on Civil Services Reforms on final proposals regarding Performance Management, Promotions and Career Planning preceded the detailed deliberation on the matter. It was emphasized that existing evaluation framework is insufficient to objectively evaluate the performance of civil servants. It was observed that individual performance evaluation system must be embedded in organizational level indicators; hence the performance management must be at two levels – organizational and individual. Mainly, following were specific recommendations in this regard:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contract, setting goals & objective, quantifiable, measurable and verifiable KPIs & measures to achieve them, to be negotiated between the PM, 	<p>After thorough deliberation by the Task Forces, the proposals presented to the Task Forces by the sub-group were approved in principle with the decision to share the final report after some minor modifications with the Establishment Division for their views and comments. Upon receipt of the final report from the sub-group and the comments of the Establishment Division, summary will be submitted to the Cabinet in the light of the proposals for its consideration and approval.</p>

	<p>the relevant Minister and then down the line</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Job descriptions to be sketched with greater precision enabling better internal work distribution • Objectives, goals & targets to be developed in a medium-term context, influenced by institutional mandates & allocations committed by the Finance Division in the Medium Term Budgetary Framework to enable delivery plan & outputs. Regular progress reviews will take place to revise KPIs periodically if there were any circumstances beyond the control of the officer. • Primary purpose of PERs should be to develop officer's performance based on evaluation of goals, targets & priorities fixed jointly at start of year and potential for future career progression including training needs, rotation etc. • Post holder having right to review assessment of reporting and counter-signing officers. • Post holders should also assess the mentoring and guidance provided to them by the senior/reporting officers • Eligibility for promotion to Grade 18 (non-selection post) to be managed either through existing arrangement-the Departmental 	
--	--	--

	<p>Committees (using existing criteria- seniority-cum-fitness) or through Promotion Board - with broader multiple stakeholder membership for promotion</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some functions, presently carried out by Secretariat Group, require knowledge and experience of government processes and systems. These may have to be retained within the same Ministries • Promotion to Grades 19 and 20 would be anchored in the following eligibility pegs (grading on a scale of 1 to 10): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Performance evaluation (achievement against each target) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Performance in compulsory domain trainings • Knowledge and quality of, and attitude to, work ○ Acceptance of Responsibility ○ Decision making ability for level ○ Ability to plan work and quality of task management ○ Integrity and propriety ○ Political impartiality ○ Alignment/compatibility with Departmental 	
--	---	--

	<p>vision</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Interpersonal skills and role as team player ○ Communication flair and public dealing ○ Analytical and problem solving capability <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotions to Grade 21 and above would be anchored in the following eligibility pegs (grading on a scale of 1 to 10) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Performance evaluation in two previous grades ○ Performance in some recent assignments ○ Willingness & ability to take additional responsibilities, initiatives and decisions ○ Ability to formulate tasks with clarity & assign them appropriately ○ Supervisory & coordination capability ○ Record of subordinate feedback on role as mentor and motivator • Establishment Division also needs re-engineering in terms of skill sets, systems and business processes • Give clear indication of likelihood of promotion beyond Grade 19. Not promoted after specified number of years in existing grade to stand retired. • A decent retirement plan/package required based 	
--	--	--

	on level & years of service.	
Summary on Proposal for Strengthening of Capacity of Ministries	Proposal related to strengthening of capacity of the ministries by appointing technical advisors and subject matter experts to assist in the senior-level technical decision making was deliberated at length.	It was decided that a summary on appointment of advisors to the ministers shall be sent to the Cabinet for its consideration and approval.
Presentations on Service Delivery Reforms vis-à-vis Education, Health and Police in the Punjab	Primary & Secondary Education, Primary & Secondary Healthcare, Tertiary Health and Medical Education and Provincial Police departments of the Government of the Punjab presented the service delivery reforms introduced in their departments. Various issues associated with each aspect were discussed at length. The main observation of the members was that although the reforms interventions were relevant, however there was a need to focus on the outcomes of various interventions.	<p>It was decided that Education department will share, through Secretary Food Punjab, a report on the reforms already undertaken and future plan of action for comparison along with budgetary spending.</p> <p>It was also decided that outcomes of the reforms initiatives will be shared by the health departments for information of the members.</p> <p>Regarding a need to improve the enforcement of local and special laws in the districts and</p>

		<p>tehsils and changes to the Civil Administration Act, 2017, the chair observed that the Provincial Task Force needed to focus on this area and recommend concrete steps.</p>
--	--	--